

Argument-Driven Comparative Analysis Pre-Writing Exercise: Evaluating Claims

Directions: Read each of the claims below, which come from former students' argument-driven comparative analysis assignments. Considering the criteria for an effective claim—and for a comparative analysis assignment in particular—you will rank the claims according to their effectiveness. Take notes for each claim and be prepared to discuss and explain the reasoning for your rankings to the class.

1 = Most effective / *6 = Least effective*

_____ 1. While Leonard and Gleiser both focus on technology in their arguments, I will argue that Gleiser does not directly discuss the crucial impact that globalization has on linguistic diversity.

_____ 2. Changing cultural contexts (like Hill does) can lead to important realizations about identity because those new environments can cause people to challenge their cultural assumptions and revise their beliefs (like Ahmed does).

_____ 3. Traves and Leonard both provide convincing evidence for the linguistic imperialism occurring throughout the world as it becomes more westernized, but only Traves offers a practical solution to the problem. Educating EFL learners to use English as a bridge language will reduce the tendency of language and technology consumers to view languages and cultures as hierarchical.

_____ 4. While I agree with Gleiser's assertion that technology is bringing the world closer together, I cannot accept the underlying either/or fallacy that drives his central claim.

_____ 5. Even though diverse cultures consume the same global products, it does not mean that these products are creating a monoculture. Different cultural groups can assign unique meanings to the global products they consume and are not at the mercy of consumerism.

_____ 6. Overall, I disagree with Leonard's assertion that the world has already homogenized into a monoculture because he overlooks the deep-rootedness of one's ethnic roots and tribal instincts.

Homework: Now that you are able to evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of a comparative claim, it is your turn to draft your own! Type or handwrite your claim and bring it to our next class. Be prepared to share and discuss.